

-
24. URL: <http://redstar.ru/2022/10/26/> (date of access: 26.10.2022).
 25. URL: <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/16788491> (date of access: 12.01.2023).
 26. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 18.03.2023).
 27. URL: <https://www.rian.ru> (date of access: 02.05.2023).
 28. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 24.05.2023).
 29. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 24.05.2023).
 30. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 10.03.2022).
 31. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 13.03.2022).
 32. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 18.04.2022).
 33. URL: <https://vgtrk.ru> (date of access: 11.05.2022).
 34. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 20.05.2023).
 35. URL: <https://tass.ru> (date of access: 28.02.2023).

Received: 17.06.2023.

Accepted for publication: 30.06.2023.

KANYBEK KUDAYAROV. TÜRKİYE “THOUGHT FACTORIES” ON RUSSIA’S SMO IN UKRAINE *

Keywords: Special Military Operation / SMO; Russian-Ukrainian conflict; Türkiye; analytical centers; experts.

Kanybek Kudayarov,
 PhD(History), Research Associate,
 Center for Interdisciplinary Research,
 INION RAN,
 e-mail: kana8306@mail.ru

Citation: Kudayarov K. Türkiye “Thought Factories” on Russia’s SMO in Ukraine // Russia and the Moslem World, 2024, № 1 (323), P. 93–112. DOI: 10.31249/rimm/2024.01.06

* The article was written for the research project on the role of think tanks and expert communities in the development of scientific diplomacy in relations with countries of the global South in terms of shaping Russia’s role in the world and the image of Russia’s future; the project is supported by the Russian Ministry of Education and Science and the Expert Institute for Social Research. State registration number of the article: 123091200069-1

Abstract. The article discusses Türkiye analytical centers that study Russia's internal affairs in Ukraine. The brain centers involved in the coverage of the Russian-Ukrainian crisis have been identified, the materials of these "thought factories" have been selectively studied.

About 7 analytical centers (ACs) of Türkiye¹ are engaged in post-Soviet research. However, a count of materials on the websites of Türkiye think tanks revealed 20 "thought factories"² that in one way or another cover the topics of the Russian SMO in Ukraine. The increased interest in Russia's Special Military Operation in Ukraine and its consequences, which affected many countries around the world, indicates the significance of events in Eastern Europe for the entire world community.

This review briefly examines 16 "think tanks" that directly or indirectly address the topic of the Russian-Ukrainian crisis. The materials of the Economic and Social Research Foundation of Türkiye (SETA), which is one of the largest and most influential Türkiye "think tanks",³ are examined in more detail. The SETA website lists 34 items of materials covering the subject of SMO. Considering that SETA is positioned by many experts as a pro-government AC that fully supports the policies of the ruling Justice and Development Party (JDP) in Türkiye and provides it with information, analytical and consulting services, the general position of the Fund when considering the SMO corresponds to the official position of the Türkiye leadership. Let's look at 8 publications by key SETA experts to get a more detailed understanding of the Foundation's position on Special Military Operations. Of these publications, five refer to 2022, and the remaining 3 to 2023.

The work of the research director of the Washington branch of SETA, Kilich Kanat, published in the Türkiye state daily newspaper Daily Sabah (dated March 9, 2022), can be considered one of the earliest articles on SMO. In this article he argues that Ankara's position regarding the Russian - Ukrainian crisis is extremely clear: Russian troops must be withdrawn from the

territory of Ukraine, and independence and the territorial integrity of Ukraine must be respected by everyone. Kanat also says that Türkiye continues to conduct defense cooperation with Kiev and supply armed drones to the Ukrainians. The author also emphasizes the position of the Türkiye opposition forces, expressed in the form of absolute disagreement with the policies of Recep T. Erdogan and the ruling Justice and Development Party, accusing the latter of supporting the regime of Vladimir Putin.⁴

On the same day, an article by Muhittin Ataman, editor-in-chief of Insight Türkiye magazine, was published on the Daily Sabah page. Ataman argues that only the US benefited from the SMO, which, thanks to its launch, was able to consolidate around itself European partners in NATO and strengthen its position in Europe as a whole. At the same time, M. Ataman emphasizes the obvious economic losses for the countries of the European continent associated with the forced severance of trade and economic cooperation with the Russian Federation.⁵

In the March 10, 2022 edition of Daily Sabah, Kilych Bugra Kanat, analyzing the first two weeks after the start of the SMO in Ukraine, rightly suggested that “it is too early to predict the outcome of the war or analyze the potential consequences of the conflict, since events are developing very quickly. Kanat analyzes the possible and actual economic consequences of the SMO for the Russian Federation, lists some foreign policy changes associated, first of all, with the beginning of the diplomatic isolation of Russia from Western countries.

An article entitled “Bolder Steps Needed for Peace in the War in Ukraine,” written by SETA Brussels Coordinator and SETA Thematic Director for Society and Media Studies, Talha Köse, states that that “a change of leadership in Moscow could have significant consequences for all actors, but the Russian people and the Russian establishment are united around Putin.” Concluding his thoughts, the expert argues that “there is an urgent need to return to diplomacy in order to prevent a catastrophe in Ukraine. A ceasefire can only be achieved with the

help of bolder decisions and steps on the part of leaders in both Moscow and Kiev".⁶

SETA experts and some other international researchers who participated in the TRT World Forum 2022 "Mapping the Future: Uncertainties, Realities and Opportunities", held in Istanbul, believe that the Russian-Ukrainian conflict will continue until complete mutual exhaustion, with possible "respites" to replenish military forces, since loss is unacceptable for both sides.

Türkiye experts G.Sh. Ozdemir and R. Oncel, in the article "The War in Ukraine Revolutionized the Fight against Drones," believe that a new era of UAV use may have arrived, a feature of which is the use of both military and civilian drones in Ukraine. Military and commercial unmanned aerial vehicles have brought more benefits to the war effort than expensive fighter jets or other military systems in terms of cost-effectiveness and efficiency and procurement capabilities. This has led to innovative operational concepts that demonstrate the power of simple, cheap and easy-to-use technologies as opposed to the existing expensive and difficult-to-develop military mainstream.

Kadir Ustyun, executive director of SETA in Washington, in his article "What is behind China's "peace plan" for Ukraine?", examines China's position on the Russian-Ukrainian crisis against the backdrop of the publication of the Chinese peace plan for the political settlement of the Ukrainian crisis, which was harshly criticized in the West. The author emphasizes that Chinese initiatives are aimed at relieving tension in the Eastern European region through diplomatic means. The PRC is not interested in the victory of the collective West over Russia, and the Chinese leadership's unofficial support for Russia, as Ustyun believes, is explained by China's reluctance to enter into confrontation with the collective West and spoil relations with Ukraine, which could affect primarily the existing trade and economic relations between Beijing and Western partners. In this difficult situation, the Chinese authorities see a solution in unburdened support of the Russian Federation, expressed in the

political and economic plane, without affecting military support, in contrast to the costly campaign of the West to support Ukraine.⁷

In another review, Kadyr Ustyun cites a number of opinions of Western politicians and experts regarding Western policy to support Ukraine; these points of view do not boil down to a single denominator regarding the degree of support necessary to strengthen the defense capability of the Ukrainian army. At the same time, Washington's concerns are also indicated in connection with this support, which, to some extent, may weaken its military readiness to repel possible Chinese aggression against Taiwan. The author points out that the loss of diplomatic and economic relations with the West for Russia could be compensated by the BRICS countries and, more generally, the countries of the "global south," which represent that part of the world that "does not seem to buy the Biden administration's narrative of the historical struggle between democracies and autocracies in the war in Ukraine".⁸

The next center we are considering is the Foreign Policy Institute (DPE).⁹ There are 17 articles on the DPE website that mention events in Ukraine and Northeast Russia. Let's consider two of them: from July 15, 2022 and April 2, 2023. The first mention concerns an interview given by Henry Kissinger to Bernhard Sand, a correspondent for *Der Spiegel*. During the interview, Kissinger said that the fact that all the territory between Berlin and the Russian border passed to NATO made Ukraine a key point for Russia. Kissinger also believes that the conflict in Ukraine, on the one hand, is being fought for the balance of power (in the region and the world), and on the other hand, when this conflict ends, the question will be whether Russia will achieve a coherent relationship with Europe or whether it will become an outpost of Asia on the border of Europe? The political scientist also believes that the primary responsibility of the US and the collective West is to prevent a possible war between the two largest high-tech countries – China

and the US, which will definitely be a lose-lose for both sides. In the situation with Ukraine, the expert outlined it briefly: two nuclear groups are waging a conventional war on the territory of a third state.¹⁰

The second mention is made by Gülsum Akbulut, Director of the Department of Global and Türkiye Economic Studies at the Foreign Policy Institute. In the article "The Resilience of the Russian Economy After the invading Ukraine," she believes that the Russian economy will continue to experience recession in the coming years. Even if the military conflict is resolved, the expectation of a new Cold War era between West and East suggests that a return to pre-SMO economic conditions may not be possible. The long-term impact of sanctions on Russia's economic strength remains uncertain, but it is clear that the country's economic resilience has been put to a test. It is therefore critical for third parties to gain a comprehensive understanding of the long-term consequences of the conflict and the consequences of EU and US actions.¹¹

Center for Economic and Foreign Policy Research (EDAM)

There are over 15 references to SMO on the EDAM¹² website. Let's consider just one of them. The authors (Tadjan Ildem – head of AC EDAM and expert Sedan Yulgen), describing the first day of the Russian Federation's SMO in Ukraine, emphasize that Russia violated the basic principles directly related to European security, which were confirmed by the Helsinki Final Act of 1975, the Charter of Paris (1990.) and the Istanbul Charter (1999), to which it was a party. It is indicated that Türkiye is an important ally of NATO and, as part of its membership in this organization, Ankara will contribute to the implementation of the steps that NATO will take to strengthen the system of deterrence and defense. Ilden and Yulgen believe that in such a situation it will also be difficult for Türkiye to

pursue the policy of balance between its NATO allies and Russia.¹³

Next, let's look at two events conducted by the Eurasian Center for Strategic Studies (ASAM).¹⁴ The first event took place in April 2022 in the format of an open online lecture by Associate Professor of the Aegean University, historian S. Acar. As part of a lecture entitled "Historical Background of Türkiye-Russian-Ukrainian Relations", which was broadcast live via the hosting channel Youtube, S. Acar spoke about the relationship between the Turks and the Eastern Slavs, between the Ottoman and Russian Empires, ending his lecture with the events of today and Russia - Ukrainian crisis. Speaking about the current situation around the SMO, Acar believes that violation of the integrity of Ukraine's borders is to the detriment of Türkiye. If Ankara is left alone with Moscow in the Black Sea, Türkiye interests in the Black Sea will suffer in the long term.¹⁵ Despite the fact that this video was published over a year ago (April 2, 2022), it has only received 440 views to date.

On May 16, 2022, a conference entitled "Regional Geopolitical Events and the US War in Ukraine" was held within the walls of the Eurasian Center for Strategic Studies, also posted on YouTube, which received less than two hundred views. During his speech, Türkiye expert Güçlüer listed the main stages in the formation of the US of America as a world power, where at the first stage control over Europe was established through NATO, at the second stage control over Africa and the Middle East, at the third stage a policy of establishing control over Iran and Russia, and finally, at the last, fourth stage, control must be established over China.

In recent years, the expert believes, a policy has been promoted to establish control over China. To suppress the PRC, the Americans are using the Syrian war, the Armenian-Azerbaijani military confrontation, events in Kazakhstan and the Ukrainian-Russian conflict. China is in a state of uncontrolled economic growth, and this economic growth also brings greater

political and military weight. This in turn leads to the movement of global capital from the West to China and East Asia. Since it is impossible to stop this with the help of the economy, it is possible that a war with China will begin in the coming years.

However, first the US and the collective West must weaken Russia in order to then enter into a war with China. The author believes that if China continues to grow at this rate for another 10 years, America's hegemony will come to an end.¹⁶

Türkiye Economic Policy Research Foundation (TEPAV)¹⁷

TEPAV expert, Murat Ersavci, in the article ("Russia's attack on Ukraine: Putin must not win") dated December 28, 2022, briefly describes Russia's geopolitical successes in the Syrian crisis, and believes that the Kremlin has calculated the possible economic and diplomatic consequences that it may encounter after the start of the SMO in Ukraine. At the same time, as Savdzhı believes, the Russian leadership never expected such a protracted nature of the special operation. The author is confident that the EU and the US will continue to support Ukraine in this conflict so that the latter does not end up defeated. Summarizing his thought, Ersavci believes that Türkiye should not forget that its place is among Western democracies.¹⁸

Economic Development Fund (IKV)¹⁹

On March 17, 2023, IKV held a webinar entitled "The Second Year of the Russian-Ukrainian Crisis and its Consequences for Europe," during which the Foundation's expert, Eralp, emphasized that Türkiye's geopolitical importance has increased after the Russian-Ukrainian war. While his colleague, Achykmedzhe, noted that the Russian-Ukrainian war has changed the security paradigm in Europe in areas such as defense, finance, energy and food.

In turn, the Secretary General of the Economic Development Fund said that the war did not hinder, but rather accelerated the process of the EU's transition to renewable energy sources. Finally, the Secretary General noted that the EU is moving towards overcoming bureaucratic barriers in order to speed up the decision-making process on energy and investment projects.²⁰

Center for Middle Eastern Studies (ORSAM)²¹

The article "Changes in Ukraine's Middle East Policy"²² talks about the rapprochement of Ukraine with some states of the Middle East. In particular, this concerns KSA, whose Foreign Minister made a visit to Ukraine in February 2023, as a result of which KSA allocated \$400 million as humanitarian aid to Ukraine, as in the previous year. This fact allowed some part of the expert community to assume that bilateral relations are reaching a new level.

In its articles, ORSAM focuses more on the impact of the Russian-Ukrainian crisis on processes in international politics that have both regional and global significance. They are mentioned in articles such as: "Biden's Iraq Policy: Restoring US-Iraqi Relations After the War in Ukraine";²³ "Strengthening Iranian-Russian energy competition after the (end of) the war in Ukraine";²⁴ "Is Morocco leaving behind its neutral position in the war in Ukraine?";²⁵ "Impact of the Russian-Ukrainian conflict on Africa";²⁶ "Russian Invasion of Ukraine and Possible Consequences for Moscow's Arms Exports to the Middle East";²⁷ "The influence of the Northern Military District on Russia's position in Syria: foreign fighters and problems of the population";²⁸ "Iran's war with Ukraine: economic and strategic prospects and other materials.

Türkiye Asian Center for Strategic Studies (TASAM)²⁹

Hassan Kanpolat in the article "Ukrainian War: What Did Russia Do Wrong?"³⁰, analyzes the Russian North Military

District in Ukraine and describes the general course of the military operation. He believes it is too early to say how the SMO will develop further, saying that time will tell.

Institute of 21st Century Türkiye (21YYTE)³¹

Umut Badakoglu³² speaks about the state of Russia's tank and armored capabilities in the Northern Military District, as well as the role of armored forces in various conflicts in the world. The author identifies the key characteristics of tanks that are currently attracting the attention of American, Chinese, Türkiye and other armies of the world.

In the article "British-German conflict in the Ukrainian-Russian war",³³ Alaeddin Yalchinkaya writes that the British and Americans are deliberately weakening Germany, and, at the same time, trying to prevent a possible alliance between the Russian Federation and Germany. The author briefly talks about England's policy towards Germany (Europe) and Russia, carried out over the past centuries. Yalcinkaya believes that the existing Russian-Ukrainian conflict will continue.

The website of the analytical center contains a total of more than 7 articles directly or indirectly related to the subject of SMO. In general, the authors focus more attention on international and global politics, the development of world trends in various aspects of the life of states, periodically making excursions into the history of international relations during the Cold War and earlier historical periods.

Strategic Thinking Institute (SDE)³⁴

Ilyas Syupurgedzhi in the article "The importance of the center of gravity and balance in the war over the Russian-Ukrainian struggle" reflects on the centers of gravity of Russia and Ukraine, emphasizing that the West and Ukraine consider the Kremlin as such a center of gravity in the Russian Federation.

In turn, writes Syupurgedzhi, Kyiv was initially considered the center of gravity of Ukraine, but later the Donbass region and the Black Sea ports also began to be perceived as such.

In total, SDE has 5 articles related to the subject of SMO.

Strategic Studies Center (ASSAM)³⁵

Ali Qajar, in the article “The situation in the 8th month of the Russian-Ukrainian conflict,” believes that the situation around the SMO is a continuation of the policy of the global oligarchy to establish control over the world, by organizing a global economic recession, inciting conflicts, etc., which should also lead to a significant reduction in the world population.³⁶

A similar position is taken by Suat Gün, who noted that representatives of world/global capital manage not only organizations, but also entire states, pursuing exclusively their own goals, which run counter to the generally accepted official position of states.

Ankara Policy Center (APM)³⁷

Diplomat Metin Kılıç, in the article “The situation in Central Asia after the (beginning of) the Russian-Ukrainian conflict: Kazakhstan,” cites Kazakhstan’s position on the SMO, outlines Kazakh-Russian and Kazakh-Chinese relations. The author points to the strengthening of relations between Astana and Beijing and mutual interest in further enhancing bilateral cooperation within the framework of the One Belt, One Road initiative.³⁸

In March and September 2022, two online conferences were held under the special APM section ‘Diplomatic wisdom’, numbers 10 and 12 on the topics: “Russian-Ukrainian conflict in global strategic competition and its impact on international security” and “Ukraine: what’s going on?”³⁹ Türkiye experts took part in the first conference, and the second also included the

Ambassador of Ukraine to Türkiye V. Bodnar and former adviser to the Prime Minister of Ukraine on Foreign Affairs E. Gaber. The current situation in the Northeast Military District zone was discussed, as well as Ukraine's position on this issue.

Center for Eurasian Studies (AVİM)⁴⁰

The materials of the analytical center posted on the AVİM website include articles from the Türkiye state news channel "TRT Haber", which, firstly, suggests that AVİM does not have its own analytics on the topic of SMO; secondly, that the opinion of the state, and therefore the state and pro-government ACs, coincides with the opinion of AVİM.

Center for Strategic Studies of the Sages (BİLGESAM)⁴¹

An expert at the BİLGESAM analytical center, I. Yulger, believes that the beginning of the Russian-Ukrainian crisis caused a reconsideration of European security issues and increased EU funding for defense. As an example, Yulger cites Germany, which initially did not consider increasing military spending, but changed its mind on this matter after the events of February 24, 2022.⁴²

Center for Humanitarian and Social Research (İNSAMER)⁴³

Center employee F. Beyaz, in the article "China's attitude to the Russian-Ukrainian conflict," believes that the conflict between Russia and Ukraine has created the ground on which China can challenge the international system, although not directly, not openly. China is trying to turn existing geopolitical realities into opportunities without damaging its image in international relations and at the same time undermining the global authority of the US. The author emphasizes that with its position regarding

the Russian-Ukrainian conflict, China is trying to show that it is not opposed to the EU, taking a position that does not provoke the European Union, thereby maintaining the balance of power.⁴⁴

Caucasus Center for Strategic Studies (KAFKASSAM)⁴⁵

Borzu Daragahi, speaking about the incident that occurred on the night of May 3, 2023, when unmanned aerial vehicles attacked the Moscow Kremlin, believes that a series of events of this kind (including an attack on an oil depot in Crimea April 29 of this year and other events), make it clear that the location of the upcoming battles will not be limited to the geography of Ukraine and the Russian border region.⁴⁶

Conclusion

A review of Türkiye's "thought factories" showed that, in general, they cover and analyze events related to the Russian North Military District in Ukraine close to the official position of the Türkiye leadership. Despite the presence of some points related to the easy condemnation of Russia's policy regarding the start of the military action in Ukraine in the first weeks after the start of the conflict, in general, it is of a rather restrained nature (especially when compared with the rhetoric of Western experts).

As a result of a small review (which does not imply a detailed consideration of all available materials), it was revealed that anti-Russian rhetoric in the materials of the Türkiye AC is present (albeit in a superficial and insignificant form in terms of content) in 7 of the 20 analytical centers of the Türkiye Republic.⁴⁷ However, their popularity and influence (including the reach of the target audience) are much inferior to the SETA Foundation for Economic and Social Research, which suggests that, in general, the negativity towards Russian policy in Ukraine is completely (or mostly) leveled out by government and near-government think tanks and the media.

The negative rhetoric of the SMO of the RF is rather superficial and is mainly associated with a painful awareness of the growing influence of Russia in the Black Sea region and the greater penetration of the US into the zone of Türkiye geopolitical interests. Considering the special role that Türkiye is trying to play in world geopolitics, any intervention by extra-regional powers in its zone of interests is perceived quite painfully by it.

Despite the fact that there are materials (7 AC) condemning the policy of the Russian Federation in Ukraine, the essence of the articles reviewed is more neutral in nature, aimed at an analytical overview of the general situation and the alignment of regional and global forces in this conflict. The presence of anti-Western and anti-American attacks in publications indicates Türkiye's special position regarding the Russian-Ukrainian conflict, despite its close mutual relations with Western states. Considering that the largest and most influential AC in Türkiye, SETA, described the current situation around the NWO in neutral tones, we can say that all state media in Türkiye, as well as a number of news agencies affiliated with the Türkiye government, take a similar position on the SMO.

References

1. Yılmaz A. Türkiye expert and analytical centers for the study of the post-Soviet space // Questions of history, archeology, political science and regional studies (Collection of materials of the XIV All-Russian (with international participation) scientific conference of students, undergraduates, graduate students and young scientists (Tomsk, 25-27 April 2018) Issue 14. Vol. 2. P. 46-49.
2. Economic and Social Research Foundation of Türkiye (SETA), Foreign Policy Institute (DPE), Economic and Foreign Policy Research Center (EDAM), Eurasian Strategic Studies Center (ASAM), Türkiye Economic Policy Research Foundation (TEPAV), Economic Development Foundation (İKV) , Center for Middle Eastern Studies (ORSAM), Türkiye-Asian Center for Strategic Studies (TASAM), Institute for 21st Century Türkiye (21YYTE), Institute for Strategic Thinking (SDE), Advocates for Strategic Studies Center (ASSAM), Ankara Policy Center (APM), Center Eurasian Studies (AVİM),

-
- Center for Strategic Studies of the Sages (BİLGESAM), Center for Humanitarian and Social Research (İNSAMER), Caucasus Center for Strategic Studies (KAFKASSAM).
3. *Kudayarov K.A.* Activities of the Foundation for Economic and Social Research of Türkiye SETA // Bulletin of the Russian State University for the Humanities. Series "Eurasian Studies. Story. Political science. International relationships". 2023. No. 3. P. 118-129. – URL: [https://www.rsuh.ru/upload/main/vestnik/eiipmo/Vestnik_ehpi_3\(2023\).pdf](https://www.rsuh.ru/upload/main/vestnik/eiipmo/Vestnik_ehpi_3(2023).pdf)
 4. *Kanat K.* An already unexpected situation in Russia-Ukraine war // Daily Sabah, March 9, 2022. URL: <https://www.setav.org/en/an-already-unexpected-situation-in-russia-ukraine-war/> (date of access: 19 February 2023).
 5. *Ataman M.* In Ukraine: Europe loses, the US gains // Daily Sabah, March 9, 2022. URL: <https://www.dailysabah.com/opinion/columns/in-ukraine-europe-loses-the-us-gains> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
 6. *Kose T.* Bolder steps required for peace in Ukraine war // Daily Sabah, April 20, 2022. URL: <https://www.setav.org/en/bolder-steps-required-for-peace-in-ukraine-war/> (date of access: 10 February 2023).
 7. *Ustün K.* What's behind China's Ukraine 'peace plan' // SETAV. URL: <https://www.setav.org/en/whats-behind-chinas-ukraine-peace-plan/> (date of access: 12 February 2023).
 8. *Ustün K.* Assessing Western aid to Ukraine: how far can it go? // SETAV. URL <https://www.setav.org/en/assessing-western-aid-to-ukraine-how-far-can-it-go/> (date of access: 15 February 2023).
 9. A private think tank with close ties to Bilkent University, whose alumni include Hakan Fidan, head of the Türkiye Foreign Ministry (since 2023) and former head of the Türkiye National Intelligence Organization (2010-2015, 2015-2023); Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu - former head of the Türkiye Foreign Ministry (2014-2015, 2015-2023); Yigit Bulut is the chief adviser to Türkiye President R.T. Erdogan (since 2013) and others.
 10. *Zand B.* Interview with H. Kissinger "There is no good historical example" for war in Ukraine // Spiegel. URL: <https://foreignpolicy.org.tr/there-is-no-good-historical-example-for-war-in-ukraine/> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
 11. *Akbulut G.* Russian Economic Resilience in the Wake of the Ukraine invasion // Foreign Policy Institute (FPI). URL: <https://foreignpolicy.org.tr/russian-economic-resilience-in-the-wake-of-the-ukraine-invasion/> (date of access: 10 February 2023).
 12. An independent think tank with a wide range of research in the areas of international politics and security, cyber policy, arms control, energy and climate change. AC has a large staff of experts, some of whom, to some extent, can be classified as pro-Western. These include, for example, Takan

- Ildem, former NATO Assistant Secretary General for Public Diplomacy (2016-2020); Meltem Müftüler-Bac – professor at Sabancı University (the most liberal university in Türkiye); Çigdem Yüstün is a freelance fellow at the Australian Institute of International Affairs; Sinan Ülgen is a former Türkiye diplomat, research fellow at the Carnegie European Center in Brussels and others.
13. Ildem T., Ülgen S. Rusya'nın Ukrayna'yı İşgali [Russian invasion of Ukraine] // Ekonomi ve Dış Politika Araştırmalar Merkezi (EDAM). URL: <https://edam.org.tr/rusyanin-ukraynayı-isgali/> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
 14. This AC may have connections with the government or near-government structures, since the organization includes people close to government parties – the Justice and Development Party (AKP) and the Nationalist Movement Party (MHP): Musa Serdar Çelebi – initiator of the Union of Türkiye Islamic Cultural Associations of Europe; Şaban Gulbahar is one of the founders of the Euro-Asian Türkiye Foundation for Economic, Social and Cultural Research; Abdullah Kılıç is a teacher in organizations affiliated with the MHP and many other experts.
 15. Acar S. Türk-Rus-Ukrayna Münasebetlerinin Tarihi Arka Planı [Historical background of Türkiye-Russian-Ukrainian relations] // Avrasya Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi (ASAM). URL: <https://www.asam.org.tr/haber/turk-rus-ukraynamunasebetlerinin-tarihi-arka-planı#> (date of access: 11 February 2023).
 16. Bölgesel Jeopolitik Gelişmeler ve ABD'nin Ukrayna Savaşı [Regional geopolitical events and the US war in Ukraine] // Avrasya Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi (ASAM). URL: <https://www.asam.org.tr/haber/bolgesel-jeopolitik-gelistmeler-ve-abdnin-ukrayna-savasi> (date of access: 12 February 2023).
 17. The AC is engaged in a comprehensive analysis of domestic and foreign policy aspects of Türkiye economic policy, analysis of economic data, fiscal and monetary policies, and urban studies. The management of the AC includes persons who have direct relation to the Türkiye government. For example, Cemil Cicek is a member of the Supreme Advisory Council under the President of the Republic of Türkiye, a former deputy from the AKP.
 18. *Ersavcı M.* Rusya'nın Ukrayna'ya saldırısı: Putin kazanmamalı // Website of the Economic Policy Research Foundation of Türkiye. URL: https://www.tepav.org.tr/tr/blog/s/7138/Rusya__nin+Ukrayna__ya+s+aldirisi_+Putin+kazanma+mali (date of access: 20 February 2023).
 19. An analytical center specializing in economic relations within the EU space, as well as interaction between Türkiye and the European Union. The leadership of the AC includes persons who have a direct or indirect

- connection with the AKP: Murat Hazyroglu – AKP functionary; Zeynel Abidin Erdem is one of the largest businessmen in Türkiye, who has good relations with the AKP and other experts.
20. Rusya-Ukraine savaşının ikinci yılı ve Avrupa acısından etkileri (03/17/2023) [The second year of the Russian-Ukrainian war and its consequences for Europe] (webinar from 03/17/2023) // İktisadi kalkınma vakfi. URL: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Sx6OmNdoSAw> (date of access: 19 February 2023).
 21. An independent AC, focused on the study of political, economic and social aspects of the development of the states of the Middle East and North Africa, whose staff includes such experts as: İbrahim Aydın – ex-member of the Türkiye Parliament from the AKP; Abdennur Tumi – also works for the pro-government newspaper Daily Sabah English; Mehmet Aladzha is an employee of the largest state news agency Anadolu Ajansı and the Daily Sabah newspaper.
 22. *Sturmak K.* Ukrayna'nın değişen Ortadoğu politikası [Changes in Ukraine's Middle East policy] // Ortadoğu Araştırmaları Merkezi, Ortadoğu analiz.
 23. *Al-Sadoon W.* Biden'ın Irak Politikası: Ukrayna Savaşı Sonrası Dünya İçin ABD-Irak İlişkilerinin Rehabilitasyonu [Biden's policy: Restoration of relations between the US and Iraq after the war in Ukraine] // Ortadoğu Araştırmaları merkezi. URL: <https://orsam.org.tr/tr/bidenin-irak-politikasi-ukrayna-savasi-sonrasi-dunya-icin-abd-irak-iliskilerinin-rehabilitasyonu/> (date of access: 5 February 2023).
 24. *Sari I.* Ukrayna savaşı sonrası artan İran-Rusya enerji rekabeti [Exacerbation of Iranian-Russian energy rivalry after the war in Ukraine] // Ortadoğu Araştırmaları Merkezi .URL: https://orsam.org.tr/d_hbanaliz/10-Ysmail_SarY.pdf (date of access: 15 February 2023).
 25. *Yetim H. Fas.* Ukraine Savaşındaki Tarafsız Tutumunu Geride mi Bırakıyor? [Morocco leaving behind its neutral position in the war in Ukraine?] // Ortadoğu Araştırmaları Merkezi. URL: <https://orsam.org.tr/tr/fas-ukrayna-savasindaki-tarafsiz-tutumunu-geride-mi-birakiyor/> (date of access: 15 February 2023).
 26. *Devecioğlu K.* Rusya-Ukrayna savaşının Afrika'ya etkileri [Consequences of the Russian-Ukrainian war for Africa] // Ortadoğu Araştırmaları Merkezi. URL: <https://orsam.org.tr/tr/rusya-ukrayna-savasinin-afrikaya-etkileri/> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
 27. *Mevlütöğlu A.* Rusya'nın Ukrayna işgali ve Moskova'nın Ortadoğu'ya Yönelik Silah İhracatına Olası Etkileri [Russian invasion of Ukraine and possible consequences for Moscow's arms exports to the Middle East] // Ortadoğu Araştırmalar ı Merkezi. URL: <https://orsam.org.tr/tr/rusyanin-ukrayna-igali-ve-moskovanın-ortadoguya-yonelik-silah-ihracatina-olasi-etkileri/> (date of access: 18 February 2023).

28. Özdemir O. Ukrayna isgalinin Rusya'nın Suriye pozisyonuna etkisi: yabancı savascılar ve nüfus meseleleri [The impact of the Ukrainian invasion on Russia's position in Syria: foreign military actions and problems of the population] // Ortadoğu Araştırmaları Merkezi. URL: <https://orsam.org.tr/tr/ukrayna-isgalinin-rusyanin-suriye-pozisyonuna-etkisi-yabanci-savascilar-ve-nufuz-meseleleri/> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
29. TASAM pays great attention to the Türkiye-speaking regions of Russia and Central Asia. As expert A. Avatkov believes, "... the activities of the Center, including those aimed at promoting the idea of a single "Türkiye world," can be regarded as destructive and potentially dangerous for Russia" [Avatkov V.A. (2022). Analytical centers and scientific policy of Türkiye // Contours of global transformations: politics, economics, law. T. 15. No. 2. P. 173–190]. URL: <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/analiticheskie-tsentry-i-nauchnaya-politika-turtsii/viewer> (date of access: 02.19.2023).
30. Kanpolat H. Ukraine Savaşı; Rusya Neleri Yanlış Yaptı? [War in Ukraine; what did Russia do wrong?] // Türk Asya Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi. URL: https://tasam.org/tr-TR/Icerik/70290/ukrayna_savasi_rusya_neleri_yanlis_yapti (date of access: 18 February 2023).
31. The AC specializes in monitoring and analyzing political, economic, technological, cultural, social and military processes occurring (in the 21st century) in the world and Türkiye.
32. Badakoğlu U. Ukrayna-Rusya Savaşı Gözlemleriyle Tank ve Zırhlı Birlikler [Tank and armored forces with observations of the Ukrainian-Russian war] // 21. yüzyıl türkiye enstitüsü. URL: <https://21yyte.org/tr/merkezler/bolgesel-arastirma-merkezleri/rusya-slav-arastirmalari-merkezi/ukrayna-rusya-savasi-gozlemleriyle-tank-ve-zirhli-birlikler> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
33. Yalçınkaya A. Ukrayna-Rusya Savaşı'ndaki İngiltere-Almanya Kapışması [The battle between Great Britain and Germany in the Ukrainian-Russian war] // 21. Yüzyıl türkiye enstitüsü. URL: <https://21yyte.org/tr/merkezler/bolgesel-arastirma-merkezleri/rusya-slav-arastirmalari-merkezi/ukrayna-rusya-savasi-ndaki-i-ngiltere-almanya-kapismasi> (date of access: 18 February 2023).
34. The AC deals with a wide range of socio-economic and political issues, the climate agenda, issues of national defense and security, as well as various aspects of the development of civil society in Türkiye and countries and regions of the world.
35. "Thought Factory", engaged in research of Muslim societies in various regions of the world. The founder and chairman of the AC is Adnan Tanrıverdi, a member of the Presidential Council for Security and Foreign

- Policy of Türkiye (2018), founder of the private Türkiye military company (PMC) SADAT.
36. *Cosar A.* Ukrayna-Rusya Savaşının 8. Ayında Durum [The state of the Russian-Ukrainian conflict in the 8th month] // Adaleti avunanlar Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi. URL: <https://www.assam.org.tr/index.php/haberler/haberler/ukrayna-rusya-savasinin-8-ayinda-durum.html> (date of access: 20 February 2023).
 37. An independent think tank established on January 30, 2012, dedicated to the study of domestic and foreign policy issues in Türkiye.
 38. *Kılıc M.* Rusya-Ukrayna catismasi sonrasinda Orta Asya'da durum: Kazakistan [The situation in Central Asia after the Russian-Ukrainian conflict: Kazakhstan] // Ankara Politikalar Merkezi. URL: <https://apm.org.tr/2022/10/08/rusya-ukrayna-catismasi-sonrasinda-orta-asyada-durum-kazakistan/> (date of access: 8 February 2023).
 39. Ukrayna; Şimdi Nereye [Ukraine: Where to now?] // Ankara Politikalar Merkezi, Diplomatik Akıl Serisi: 12. URL: <https://apm.org.tr/2022/09/12/diplomatik-akil-serisi-12-ukrayna-simdi-nereye/> (date of access: 8 February 2023).
 40. An independent analytical center founded in 2009 in Ankara, operating under the auspices of the Turkmeneli Foundation for Cooperation and Culture. AVİM strives to provide comprehensive and in-depth information on current political events in regions of strategic importance for Türkiye – the EU, the Balkans, the Black Sea region, the Caucasus and Central Asia.
 41. The Sages Center for Strategic Studies was founded in 2021 in Istanbul. The Center's research areas include foreign policy and security issues.
 42. *Ulger I.* Rusya'nın Ukrayna Saldırısı ve AB İçerisinde Yeniden Yapılanma Arayışları [Russia's attack on Ukraine and the desire for restructuring within the EU] // Bilge İnsanlar Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi (BİLGESAM). URL: <https://bilgeinsansam.com/pdf/rusyann-ukrayna-saldrs-ve-ab-icerisinde-yeniden-yapilanma-arayslar> (date of access: 10 February 2023).
 43. The Center's research focuses on expanding humanitarian assistance, strengthening humanitarian diplomacy, and promoting human rights.
 44. *Beyaz F.* Rusya-Ukrayna Savaşı'nda Çin'in Tutumu [China's position in the Russian-Ukrainian war] // İHH İnsani ve Sosyal Araştırmalar Merkezi. URL: <https://www.insamer.com/tr/rusya-ukrayna-savasinda-cinin-tutumu.html> (date of access: February 25, 2023).
 45. The Center analyzes the foreign policy situation around Iran, Türkiye, Russia (North Caucasus) and the countries of Transcaucasia.
 46. *Daragahi B.* Putin, Ukrayna saldırısının Rusya'daki olumsuz sonuçlarına karşı hazırlıksız [Borzu Daragahi: Putin is not ready for the negative consequences of Ukraine's attack on Russia] // Kafkasya stratejik

arastirmalar merkezi. URL: <https://kafkassam.com/borzou-daragahi-putin-ukrayna-saldirisinin-rusyadaki-olumsuz-sonuclarina-karsi-hazirliksiz.html> (date of access: 28 February 2023).

47. TEPAV; IKV; APM; AVIM; INSAMER; DPE; EDAM.

Received: 06.06.2023.

Accepted for publication: 20.06.2023.

ALEKSEY ILIN. TÜRKİYE-NATO DEAL: WHAT RUSSIA IS PREPARING FOR AND THE ESSENCE OF ERDOĞAN'S POLITICAL BENEFITS

Keywords: Türkiye; Sweden; NATO; Russia; European Union; political benefits.

Aleksey Ilin,

PhD(Political Science), Research Associate,

Publishing Department of the Journals

"Rossiya i Musulmanskii Mir" &

"Russia and the Moslem World", INION RAN,

e-mail: korablevrr@mail.ru

RCID 0000-0001-7002-4057

Citation: Ilin A. Türkiye-NATO Deal: What Russia is Preparing for and the Essence of Erdogan's Political Benefits // Russia and the Moslem World, 2024, № 1 (323), P. 112-119. DOI: 10.31249/rimm/2024.01.07

Abstract. The Türkiye Parliament ratified Sweden's accession to NATO. The process was quite complex and accelerated after a telephone conversation between Türkiye President Recep Tayyip Erdogan and the US President Joe Biden. It should be assumed that the parties were able to reach an agreement among themselves and each received a certain benefit. It is obvious that Türkiye asked for EU membership, strengthening the country's defense potential, and economic benefits. The US put forward a number of its demands, which certainly affected the issue of relations between Türkiye and Russia. The article also