

5. Order of the President of the Russian Federation dated May 29, 1995 N 243-RP "On the Delegation of the Russian Federation to the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of Europe" (In Russian) // President of Russia. – 1995. – May 29. – URL: <http://www.kremlin.ru/acts/bank/7920> (date of access: 14.04.2022).
6. European Outline Convention on Transfrontier Co-operation between Territorial Communities or Authorities (ETS N 106) (In Russian) // Codex Consortium. – URL: <https://docs.cntd.ru/document/901734774> (date of access: 14.04.2022).
7. The concept of "territorial communities or authorities" is defined in Article 2 of the European Outline Convention on Transfrontier Co-operation.
8. Convention on Cross-Border Cooperation of Member States of the Commonwealth of Independent States (signed in Bishkek on October 10, 2008) // Codex Consortium. – URL: <https://docs.cntd.ru/document/902196976> (date of access: 14.04.2022).

Received: 15.01.2024.

Accepted for publication: 26.01.2024.

KANYBEK KUDAYAROV. ACTIVITIES OF NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS IN THE KYRGYZ REPUBLIC

Keywords: NPO; non-governmental organizations; Kyrgyz Republic; donors; think tanks; financing; program.

Kanybek Kudayarov,
PhD(History), Research Associate,
Centre for Interdisciplinary Research,
INION RAN
e-mail: kana8306@mail.ru

Citation: Kudayarov K. Activities of Non-Profit Organizations in the Kyrgyz Republic // Russia and the Moslem World, 2024, № 3 (325), P. 29–50. DOI: 10.31249/rmw/2024.03.03

Abstract. The article is devoted to a brief overview of NPOs in Kyrgyzstan. The term "non-profit organization" is defined, the forms of NPOs are indicated, the history of the development of this type of organization in Kyrgyzstan and the evolution of their legal status are

described. Based on information officially presented on NPO websites, an attempt has been made to consider the largest non-profit organizations in the country in terms of their areas of activity, as well as their impact on the development of the society and the state.

According to the Law of the Kyrgyz Republic, a non-profit organization is a voluntary self-governed organization created by physical and (or) legal entities on the basis of community of their interests for realization of spiritual or other non-material needs in interests of the members and (or) all society for which generation of profit is not main objective of activities and the got profit is not shared between members, founders and officials. [1] At the same time, the legislation of Kyrgyzstan does not give a definition of “non-governmental organization”, making this term non-legal. However, some experts believe [2] that NGOs are an integral part of NPOs. There are 15 organizational and legal forms of NPOs provided for by Kyrgyz legislation: public association, foundation, institution (private, state or municipal), association of legal entities, jamaat (community organization), cooperative, homeowners’ partnership (condominium), TPSG bodies, water users association, self-regulatory organization of professional securities market participants, non-state pension fund, employers’ association, trade union, political party and religious organization. All of these are NPOs, while first five are also NGOs [1].

The total number of NPOs in Kyrgyzstan is 29,130 [3]. Moreover, the majority of non-profit organizations (18,500) are located in Bishkek, the capital of the republic [4]. There are approximately 400 actually functioning NPOs [5].

In Kyrgyzstan, the activities of NPOs are tied to permanent external funding, since donors are predominantly foreign (mainly Western organizations). Among them, we can single out the largest sponsors such as the Soros-Kyrgyzstan Fund (SKF)¹, the Friedrich Ebert Foundation², the Konrad Adenauer Foundation³, the National Democratic Institute⁴, the EU [3], UN structures, etc.

Most often, they sponsor projects of some Kyrgyz NGOs, while frequently being also a customer.

Uncertainty in obtaining funding (which depends on whether a non-profit organization wins a tender, competition or grant to implement a project) determines the activities of NPOs, the dynamics of which can vary significantly from year to year [2].

Judging by the areas of funding indicated by the Asian Development Bank, most of the international organizations and donors working in the Kyrgyz Republic allocate about 40 per cent of funds to human rights organizations, 25 per cent is spent on health care, and 20 per cent – on education. Only a small part of the allocated funds is reserved for promoting gender issues, addressing environmental concerns and sociological research (5 per cent) [3, p. 2].

It is not possible to estimate the entire amount of NGO funding allocated by donors, but at least two organizations – the Soros-Kyrgyzstan Fund⁵ and USAID⁶ – have provided a total of over \$515 million for the implementation of various projects in the republic.

For example, the Soros Foundation has spent more than \$115.05 million to support civil initiatives in a variety of areas, such as: legal, educational and economic reforms; needs of the media industry, NGOs and academia; as well as initiatives in the field of public policy, healthcare and culture. In 2022, the Fund's expenses amounted to \$3,613,598⁷. Of these, \$848,915 were spent on public healthcare, \$421,956 on the legal program, \$379,690 on the educational program, \$338,976 on media development, \$266,160 on administrative department, and \$216,614 on information program. Administrative expenses amounted to \$1,141,287.

In turn, the US Agency for International Development (according to the official information presented on the organization's website) supports programs promoting democratic institutions, healthcare, education and economic growth [1, p. 3].

Another fund, the equally famous Friedrich Ebert Foundation positions itself as a foundation that supports programs aimed at achieving social justice and inclusive economic development; promoting social and ecological transformation; encouraging civic engagement; and supporting diplomatic policies.

It should be noted that almost all NGOs in the republic are to a certain extent involved in the program for achieving the UN Sustainable Development Goals⁸. Kyrgyzstan has been very successful in implementing this policy, ranking 45th in the world for this indicator in 2023⁹.

According to data presented by political scientist D. Berdakov, as of 2016, there were 250 thousand people working in the NPO sector in Kyrgyzstan, which is 12 per cent of the total working population¹⁰.

According to the Ministry of Justice of the Kyrgyz Republic, in 2013, 28 per cent of NPOs operating in the country were receiving foreign funding; experts estimated their total contribution to the GDP of the republic at 2.2 per cent¹¹. At the same time, about 62 per cent of NPOs in one way or another recruited volunteers for temporary work. Today, 400 actively working Kyrgyz NGOs employ 17 thousand people [5], while there are only a thousand more civil servants in the country (18 thousand people)¹². In 2022, actively working NPOs paid more than 363 million Kyrgyz soms to the budget of the republic (equal to 363 million Russian roubles at the som-to-rouble exchange rate as of November 15, 2023). Their annual contribution to the GDP of Kyrgyzstan is estimated at 0.3 per cent. In 2021, 397 actively operating NPOs generated value added worth more than 2 billion soms. The non-profit sector supports local businesses by annually purchasing goods worth 600 million soms. According to other indicators, NPOs pay 125 million soms per year for state and municipal services. In 2021, value added of NPO services in healthcare amounted to 90 million soms; in education – 17 million soms; in environmental improvement – 8.5 million soms; and in social protection – 334 million soms.

NGOs spent 436 million soms on business training, promotion of female entrepreneurship, as well as training and employment of young people with disabilities [5].

According to information provided by a number of Kyrgyz experts, in 2013, 41 per cent of all funds went to non-profit organizations via membership fees and economic activities; government support and grants accounted for 6 per cent of the total amount; 47 per cent were foreign grants; and 6 per cent – donations for charitable purposes [1, p. 70]. Thus, almost half of all funds spent on the activities of NPOs are provided by foreign sponsors.

The development of NGOs in the Kyrgyz Republic began with the establishment of links with the outside world, after the Soros Foundation created in 1993 opened its branch in the republic (earlier than in other states in the region); the Soros-Kyrgyzstan Fund also saw more funding than other republics in the region. Funding in Kazakhstan amounts to \$100 million (in April 2023, the Fund was transformed into the expert and analytical hub “Central Asian Policy Studies”, CAPS Unlock); in Tajikistan – over 70 million (closed in 2022); in Uzbekistan – 20 million (closed in 2004).

Overall, the 1990s was the time when non-governmental and non-profit organizations both in Kyrgyzstan and in other countries of the post-Soviet space were being established. They were most actively growing in the second half of the 1990s, when the number of organizations in the non-profit sector reached 2201 (1997). The policy of the Kyrgyz leadership, which liberalized the economy and promoted democratic values, resulted in the state acquiring a reputation as an “island of democracy” in Central Asia. In subsequent years, the number of NGOs continued to grow, which was associated with geopolitical events in the world and in the Central Asian region (the NATO military campaign in Afghanistan in 2001–2021 and the ever-increasing presence of the US and other Western countries in the region).

Over time, NGOs began to increasingly get involved in the political life of the country, initiating debates on significant issues of social, economic and political nature. The activity of the civil sector resulted in the Concept of Cooperation between Public Associations, Foundations (Non-governmental Institutions) and Government Authorities being adopted in 2004¹³. The government reacted to NPOs strengthening their position by implementing a policy from 2006 to 2023 that limited the influence of the civil sector through relevant regulations (NLA).

Among the legal acts adopted and proposed in recent years, we should take note of those legislative acts of the Kyrgyz Republic¹⁴ that provide for liability of state authorized bodies and non-profit organizations for allowing the creation of conditions that have led to limiting the activities of NPOs; determine the procedure for submission of summary information of non-profit organization on sources of forming of money, the directions of their expenditure, and also about the acquired, used and alienable property¹⁵, etc.

The adoption of the Law "About Non-Profit Organizations"¹⁶, which introduced the concept of "foreign representative", caused a public outcry. The justification certificate given by MPs for this law states that this measure is necessary because a significant part of NGOs, contrary to the constituent documents, interferes in the political life of the state, participating, including through funding, in organizing and conducting political actions in the Kyrgyz Republic for the purpose of influencing public opinion [4]. The authors of the bill believe that it is necessary to amend the law on NPOs and clarify the concept of "foreign non-profit organization", as well as determine through which bodies these organizations can carry out their activities. The bill gives a definition of "foreign non-profit organization" [4]; also, it is proposed to introduce a legal definition of "non-commercial organization performing the functions of a foreign representative"¹⁷. The ultimate goal of this law is to suppress foreign influence on Kyrgyz NGOs in the political life of the state.

Non-profit sector representatives reacted to the authorities' policy by changing the discourse of NPOs and reforming their activities to some degree, i.e. they significantly cut back on their criticism of the state over its decisions in various spheres of national life.

Below are listed some of the largest NPOs according to their type of activity. Traditionally, the first positions are occupied by *human rights organizations and structures involved in the development of civil society*.

1. The Association of Civil Society Support Centers (ACSSC)¹⁸, an independent network of nine civil society support centers. It provides information, advice and training in the field of organizational development, financial stability, business development, social partnerships, as well as organizing and conducting advocacy campaigns¹⁹. The ACSSC approach to training includes studying the needs of clients; conducting pre-training diagnostics of organizations; development of specific training programs to suit the needs of clients; and post-training consultation. The Association also routinely conducts post-training monitoring and analysis in order to assess the impact of consultations and other capacity-building activities. Moreover, it maintains close contacts with the heads of organizations that received institutional support and corporate trainings.

2. Association of Non-Governmental Human Rights Organizations "Human Rights Advocacy Center" (HRAC)²⁰ is an independent human rights organization operating in the south of Kyrgyzstan. It provides legal services and protects the rights of low-income citizens whose constitutional rights and freedoms have been violated. Every month, 25–30 people (including women, children, people with disabilities and representatives of national minorities) receive counselling at the Human Rights Advocacy Center. The Association has conducted about 50 training sessions and seminars. It has trained 1,200 representatives of government agencies, NGOs, human rights activists and lawyers, heads and members of civil society initiative groups, and law students;

60 judges and court secretaries; as well as 30 journalists. Among other things, they have published over 10,000 works on legal issues²¹.

3. Association for the Protection of Human Rights in Criminal Process “ARTICLE9”²² is a platform for human rights organizations, as well as individuals and legal entities involved in this area²³. The Association focuses on the stages of criminal and legal proceedings, during which, as employees of this structure believe, human rights are violated. Experts reveal violations of the law during detention and medical examination; identify instances where detained persons (suspects) were denied legal assistance; and review the legality of court decisions and other stages of criminal cases and litigation. They work on each case from beginning to end. Numerous publications of the Association can be found in the “publications” section on the organization’s website.

4. Coalition against Torture in Kyrgyzstan²⁴ (consisting of 16 NGOs) is a union of human rights organizations working to prevent torture in the republic. The Coalition was founded in 2011 with the objective of consolidating the efforts of NGOs to eradicate the practice of torture and ill-treatment of detainees and prisoners; highlighting trials involving the victims of torture by law enforcement officials; challenging court decisions by filing cassation appeals, etc²⁵.

5. Public Association “Coalition for Democracy and Civil Society”²⁴ is an independent organization created for promoting civic education; improving the legal culture of voters; independent monitoring of the pre-election process and electoral activities to make sure that all participants in the electoral process observe electoral law; as well as analyzing the current situation in individual regions and in the country as a whole²⁶. One of the main objectives of the Coalition for Democracy and Civil Society is to support a transparent electoral system through civic education and independent monitoring, increasing people’s trust in the electoral system. The coalition regularly publishes reports

on ensuring protection of social and labour rights of employees of state-financed organizations (medical staff in particular), as well as protection of labour rights of women and children; reports on the issues of internal migration; reports on the quality of school education in the republic, etc.²⁷ In addition to reports, they also publish analytical information, for example, analysis of legal acts regulating the legal status of health workers²⁸. A significant part of the publications was released with the financial support of the SKF and USAID.

Many other NGOs can also be considered human rights organizations, including women's organizations, which offer their target groups a fairly wide range of services. In general, NGOs run 95 per cent of crisis centers for victims of domestic violence in Kyrgyzstan [5]. The state recognizes the effectiveness of the centers founded and managed by NGOs, and therefore provides them with funding from the budget through the social procurement mechanism.

Organizations involved in *healthcare* include:

- 1) The Association of Health Managers of the Kyrgyz Republic²⁹, created in December 2020 at the initiative of the managers of healthcare organizations³⁰. The goal of the Association is to promote the development of a sustainable and effective management system for healthcare organizations by enhancing interaction among all stakeholders, including heads of healthcare organizations, in order to improve the quality and accessibility of medical care for the population. The works published by the Association are dedicated to monitoring and prevention of various diseases, including congenital diseases, vaccination issues, etc.³¹ Seminars on the financial management of an organization (document flow, accounting and internal control system) are held periodically.

- 2) The public organization "Initiatives in Medical Education" was founded in 2012. The following year, the foundation joined a consortium with the University Hospitals of Geneva (HUG) in order to implement the "Medical Education

Reforms in the Kyrgyz Republic” (MER) project. The organization’s knowledge of the Kyrgyz healthcare system and medical education system bolstered the reform process, allowing the project to progress at all levels and transform strategic moves into concrete actions on the ground. This approach involves targeted actions at the system and executive levels coupled with the implementation of specific pilot activities. One of the main goals of the organization is the consolidation of efforts and interaction of medical educational organizations regarding the development of the system of undergraduate and postgraduate continuous education, as well as secondary medical and pharmaceutical education in the republic. The NGO’s main donor is the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).

Organizations involved in *the educational sector* include: the Foundation Education Initiatives Support (FEIS)³², the Association for Education Development in Kyrgyzstan (AED)³³, the Kyrgyz Association of Adult Education (KAAE), the Association of Parents of Disabled Children (ARDI in Russian), the Public Association “Higher School of Management” and many other NGOs.

Among the organizations listed above the most prominent one is the FEIS, which has more than 25 years of experience in implementing projects designed to improve the quality of education³⁴ by training teachers and school principals; creating educational programs; providing trainings for education system workers; publishing educational, methodological and analytical literature, etc. Among the many publications of the Foundation, we should highlight the following: “The Development and Prospects of the School Parliament in the Kyrgyz Republic”, which was implemented with the support of the EU and the Aga Khan Foundation³⁵ (2014); “Learning to Think Critically”, “School Parliament” (implemented within the framework of the project “First Steps of a Citizen: Participation of Schoolchildren in Decision Making” (2016), etc.

The Foundation's main customer is the Ministry of Education and Science of Kyrgyzstan, while the Soros-Kyrgyzstan Fund, UNICEF³⁶ and other organizations act as donors.

Environmental organizations and activists³⁷ are an equally essential part of the non-profit, non-governmental sector of the republic. According to data provided by ecologist E. Shukurov, as of 2016, there were approximately 150 public organizations in Kyrgyzstan that were either involved in environmental activities or had a relative clause set out in their charter [4, p. 2]. The largest of them can be found on the website of the Climate HUB of Kyrgyzstan³⁸: the organization of legal entities "Green Alliance.KG"³⁹, the Aarhus Center in Bishkek, the Ecological Movement "BIOM"⁴⁰, the youth environmental movement "MoveGreen"⁴¹, the public foundation "Ekois"⁴², the Public Fund "Rural Development Fund"⁴³, Unison Group⁴⁴, Ozone Center, Central-Asian Institute for Applied Geosciences (CAIAG), the Regional Public Fund "Camp Ala-Too", the Regional Mountain Centre of Central Asia, the Central Asia Regional Environmental Center (CAREC). The exact number of environmental organizations in the republic has not been established.

In terms of realizing its expert potential, the most interesting organization is the Ecological Movement "BIOM", which originated as part of the youth branch of the Aleine Ecological Movement and subsequently became an independent organization. BIOM can be considered the largest analytical center in the republic, undertaking environmental projects in Kyrgyzstan and the Central Asian region. BIOM employees believe that the quality of the environment and people's lives can be improved only by encouraging the population to take part in the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals and the preservation of natural ecosystems. The ecological movement works with government agencies and a wide range of local, regional and global stakeholders [5, p. 41]. BIOM is recognized by its high publication activity⁴⁵, having to date published over a

hundred works on environmental issues, including educational and methodological complexes, teaching aids and various manuals. Since 1997, BIOM have implemented about 90 projects in partnership with other organizations; these projects were under programs dedicated to education; climate change; environmental safety and management; and conservation of biodiversity.

The exact number of *women's organizations in the republic*⁴⁶ is difficult to determine. According to the 2004 data, the number of NGOs classifying themselves as women's organizations reached 150⁴⁷. Since then, their number has increased significantly, although the exact figure remains unknown. Women's non-profit non-governmental organizations are represented by socially and politically active business women, operating within the framework of certain organizational structures. The largest platforms for cooperation between women's organizations in Kyrgyzstan are: the Alliance of Women's Legislative Initiatives (unites over 150 individuals and legal entities); the Forum of Women's NGOs in Kyrgyzstan (54 organizations); the Social Technology Agency; Women's Forum "Kurak", uniting women entrepreneurs; the Coalition for the Development of Women's Entrepreneurship and the Prevention of Gender-Based Violence in Kyrgyzstan (19 organizations) and other organizations [6, p. 49].

Analytical centers occupy an important niche in the non-profit sector of the Kyrgyz Republic. Among the 24 "thought factories" in the republic, 22 are NPOs [7], while the remaining two – SIAR research&consulting⁴⁸ and M-Vector – are consulting organizations engaged in research activities, among other things. This allows us to assume that they may not be classified as NPOs. In any case, this information requires clarification.

Kyrgyz analytical centers cover a wide range of activities, which is reflected in the publications of both Russian and foreign authors⁴⁹. For example, two "think tanks" – the Development Policy Institute and the Institute of Public Policy and

Administration – are engaged in various areas of law-making, reforms of state and municipal government, and development of local self-government; the Foundation Education Initiatives Support (FEIS) is developing and supporting initiatives in the field of education, culture and science, while the Health Policy Analysis Center (HPAC) addresses health-related issues⁵⁰; ORASAM⁵¹ is in charge of the political, social, cultural and humanitarian aspects of cooperation between Türkiye states; the Social Innovation Lab Kyrgyzstan (SILK) and the Silk Road Research Center⁵² are engaged in innovative development of socially significant projects; the Silk Road Research Center and the Center for Political and Legal Studies research democratic values and human rights; the Institute for Youth Development is implementing youth policy in the field of health, education and economics; the Institute for Development Assessment, the Ecological Movement “BIOM” and the Center for Political and Legal Studies work on the environmental projects within the SDG framework. Moreover, there are several structures dealing with international relations; strategic studies; security issues; social, economic and political processes in Kyrgyzstan, Central Asia and the world; and research on various integration projects, namely the Diplomatic Academy of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Institute of Strategic Analysis and Assessments of the Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University (KRSU), the Center for Eurasian Studies of the KRSU, the National Institute of Strategic Studies (NISS), the Center for Political and Legal Studies, Center “Polis Asia” and Center “Reasonable Solutions”. The Center for Political and Legal Research and the Central Asian Barometer⁵³ conduct applied research devoted to the political, social and economic life of the republic and the region.

There are a large number of NPOs in a relatively small republic as Kyrgyzstan, and if one believes the information presented on the official websites of these organizations, they are capable of influencing the development of various aspects of the social, economic and political life of society and the state.

However, not everything is so simple, since judging by the amendments to the Law “About Non-Profit Organizations”, there are very serious reasons to believe that NPOs are able to exert political, ideological, cultural and other influence on society, which may lead to all sorts of political upheavals and even a split in society. The population of the republic has first-hand knowledge of such cases. Many experts are convinced that all three political crises that occurred in the Kyrgyz Republic (in 2005, 2010 and 2020) were no accident. In part, these events could have been provoked by the activities of NGOs with foreign participation⁵⁴.

According to expert V. Komleva, “the objective of creating foreign NGOs is to help countries fight poverty, advance democracy, and protect the rights of women and migrants. However, these seemingly good goals are precisely the tool that foreign organizations use to promote their interests.”⁵⁵

Back in 2015, some Kyrgyz MPs initiated a revision of the law on NPOs and proposed a number of amendments providing for increased control over their activities by gaining full access to organizations’ documentation and information on funding. However, at that time opinions on this matter were divided in Parliament, and only in recent years this issue has been raised again. Naturally, in addition to some deputies, representatives of NPOs spoke out against the state establishing control over the non-profit sector.

Local experts have different opinions on the issue, but they generally support this initiative, emphasizing that NPOs are unwilling to give government agencies access to their documentation and disclose all sources of funding. This suggests that they have something to hide from regulatory authorities⁵⁶. Civil NGOs should be accountable to the state to the same extent as religious organizations⁵⁷.

At any rate, this issue remains relevant and is going to be the subject of research by the author of this article in the near future.

Conclusion

The Kyrgyz non-profit sector has extensive experience in interacting with the population and the state. The contribution of NPOs to the economy of the republic is quite significant (approx. 17 thousand jobs and 0.3 per cent of the country's GDP); they also provide assistance to socially vulnerable segments of the population, thus aiding the state to implement welfare policy.

In Kyrgyzstan, there are nearly 30 thousand non-profit organizations, almost one third of which receive some kind of support from abroad, amounting to about 10,000 organizations. However, of the total number of NPOs, only 400 organizations are active, receiving 47 per cent of their funds from foreign donors. Therefore, if we assume that all organizations receive roughly equal funding, it means that about half of all active non-profit organizations in Kyrgyzstan depend on foreign investments.

We have yet to explore the issues regarding financing and the influence of NPOs with foreign funding on the state and society, but it is already clear that in terms of law, the status of NPOs in the Kyrgyz Republic is going to be revised and amended.

References

1. Law of the Kyrgyz Republic "About Non-Profit Organizations" dated October 15, 1999 No. 111 (As amended on May 30, 2014 No. 82, April 23, 2016 No. 51, June 26, 2021 No. 78, February 28, 2023 No. 44) : [website]. URL: <http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/274> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.10.2023).
2. We are referring to the authors of the manual "Legal Regulation of Non-Profit Organizations and Institutions of Civil Participation", edited by N.A. Idrisov - Bishkek: T. Kirland, 2020. - 422 p. [In Russian]
3. Kudryavtseva T. Number of the day: 29,130 non-profit organizations operate in Kyrgyzstan // 24.kg : [website]. URL: https://24.kg/obschestvo/270279_tsifra_dnya29tyisyach_130_nekommercheskih_organizatsiy_rabotayut_vkyrgyzystane/ [In Russian] (date of access: 11.10.2023).
4. Justification certificate of Law of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic (Law of the Kyrgyz Republic "About Non-Profit Organizations" and the Criminal Code of the Kyrgyz Republic)."

5. Contribution of NPOs to the economy of Kyrgyzstan in numbers // KAKTUSMEDIA: [website]. URL: https://kaktus.media/doc/489012_vklad_nko_v_ekonomiky_kyrgyzstana_v_cifrah_infografika.html [in Russian] (date of access: 10.10.2023).
6. Legal Regulation of Non-Profit Organizations and Institutions of Civil Participation [in Russian]; (Tutorial) / Under the general editorship of N.A. Idrisov – Bishkek: T. Kirland, 2020. – 422 p.
7. *Kudayarov K.A.* “Thought Factories” in Modern Kyrgyzstan // Russia and the Moslem World: Science-Information Journal. – 2023. – No. 2 (328). – P. 44–55. [In Russian] DOI: 10.31249/rimm/2023.02.04.
8. Brief Overview of Civil Society in the Kyrgyz Republic / ADB Kyrgyz Resident Mission, Bishkek, November 2011. – 12 p. [In Russian]
9. *Shukurov E.J.* Ecological Movement of Kyrgyzstan / Bishkek, 2016, Ecological Movement “BIOM”. – 5 p. [In Russian]
10. *Kudayarov K.A.* Environmental Policy in Kyrgyzstan (on the Example of the BIOM Movement) // Russia and the Moslem World: Science-Information Journal. – 2022. – No. 4 (326). – P. 40–53. [In Russian]
11. *Kudayarov K.A.* Activities of Women’s NGO’s in Kyrgyzstan // Russia and the Moslem World: Science-Information Journal. – 2023. – No. 3 (329). – P. 48–65. [In Russian] DOI: 10.31249/rimm/2023.03.04.
12. *Kudayarov K.A.* Analytical Centers of Kyrgyzstan // Social Sciences and Humanities. Domestic and Foreign Literature. Series 9: Oriental and African Studies. – 2022. – No. 3. – P. 62–77. [In Russian]

Notes

1. Since 2015, it has been included in the list of foreign and international non-governmental organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation. Previously, it was represented in Russia by two organizations – the Open Society Foundation and the Open Society Institute Assistance Foundation (OSI Assistance Foundation), which are part of the Soros Foundation, a network of international charitable organizations created by the famous American financier George Soros [website]. URL: <https://minjust.gov.ru/ru/documents/7756/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.03.2023).
2. The structural divisions of the Friedrich Ebert Foundation in Russia are excluded from the register of branches and representative offices of international organizations and foreign non-profit non-governmental organizations in accordance with the orders of the Russian Ministry of Justice dated April 8, 2022 [website]. URL: <https://minjust.gov.ru/ru/events/48807/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.03.2023).

3. The structural divisions of the Konrad Adenauer Foundation in Russia are excluded from the register of branches and representative offices of international organizations and foreign non-profit & non-governmental organizations in accordance with the orders of the Ministry of Justice of Russia dated April 8, 2022 [website]. URL: <https://minjust.gov.ru/ru/events/48807/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.03.2023).
4. Full name is the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs. Since 2016, it has been included in the list of foreign and international non-governmental organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation [website]. URL: <https://minjust.gov.ru/ru/documents/7756/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.03.2023).
5. About the Foundation // The Soros-Kyrgyzstan Fund: [website]. URL: https://soros.kg/home_ru/who-we-are/about-us/ [In Russian] (date of access: 03/18/2023).
6. The United States Agency for International Development (USAID) ceased its activities in the Russian Federation in 2012 by decision of the Russian party, since it was revealed that USAID was engaged in influencing political processes in Russia through grants, including elections at various levels and civil society institutions. Between 1992 and 2020, USAID allocated over \$400 million for programs in Kyrgyzstan.
7. Annual report 2022 // The Soros-Kyrgyzstan Fund [website]. URL: https://soros.kg/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/FSK_AR2022_RU.pdf [In Russian] (date of access: 12.10.2023).
8. The Sustainable Development Goals are a call for action by all countries – poor, rich and middle-income – to promote prosperity while protecting the planet. They recognize that ending poverty must go hand-in-hand with strategies that build economic growth and address a range of social needs including education, health, social protection, and job opportunities, while tackling climate change and environmental protection. // The UN Sustainable Development Goals: [website]. URL: <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/ru/sustainable-development-goals/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.10.2023).
9. In 2023, Kyrgyzstan ranked 45th in terms of the Sustainable Development Goals and is a leader among the countries of Central Asia // National Statistical Committee of the Kyrgyz Republic : [website]. URL: <https://stat.kg/ru/news/kyrgyzskaya-respublika-zanyala-45-e-mesto-po-pokazatelyam-celej-ustojchivogo-razvitiya-za-2023-god-i-lidiruet-sredi-stran-centralnoj-azii/> [In Russian] (date of access: 12.10.2023).
10. *Berdakov D.* Kyrgyzstan and “soft power” // Nasledie : [website]. URL: <http://nasledie.ru/?q=node/4324> [in Russian] (date of access: 12.10.2023).

11. *Lukash I.* The contribution of NGOs to the GDP of Kyrgyzstan amounted to 2.2 per cent // *Vechernij Bishkek* : [website]. URL: https://www.vb.kg/doc/251350_vklad_npo_v_vvp_kyrgyzstana_sostavil_22.html [In Russian] (date of access: 12.10.2023).
12. The number of civil servants in the Kyrgyz Republic amounted to more than 18 thousand people // *KirTAG* : [website]. URL: <https://goo.su/m1aSSk> [In Russian] (date of access: 11.10.2023).
13. The Concept of Cooperation between Public Associations, Foundations (Non-governmental Institutions) and Government Authorities Approved by Government Resolution No. 200 of the Kyrgyz Republic dated March 25, 2004 // The Ministry of Justice of the Kyrgyz Republic: [website]. URL: <http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/55210> [In Russian] (date of access: 11.10.2023).
14. On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic (Law of the Kyrgyz Republic “About Non-Profit Organizations” and “On State Registration of Legal Entities, Branches (Representative Offices).” // The Ministry of Justice of the Kyrgyz Republic: [website]. URL: <http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/112273> [In Russian] (date of access: 13.10.2023).
15. Procedure for submission of summary information of non-profit organization on sources of forming of money, the directions of their expenditure, and also about the acquired, used and alienable property (Appendix 2 to the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic of March 22, 2022 No. 147) // The Ministry of Justice of the Kyrgyz Republic: [website]. URL: <http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/159058?cl=ru-ru> [In Russian] (date of access: 15.10.2023).
16. Analysis of the Draft Law “On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Kyrgyz Republic (Law of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Non-Profit Organizations”, “On State Registration of Legal Entities, Branches (Representative Offices)” and Criminal Code of the Kyrgyz Republic)”. Adopted in the first reading on October 15, 2023 // The Supreme Council of the Kyrgyz Republic : [website]. URL: http://kenesh.kg/ru/draftlaw/634426/show?fbclid=PAAaZK8dz79rpfCbJQbw1YcS-6y-fn2WD54wN2M_m1tLx7Rt63abALAWC5KM [In Russian] (date of access: 16.10.2023).
17. A non-commercial organization performing the functions of a foreign representative is a non-commercial organization established in the Kyrgyz Republic that receives funds and other property from foreign states, their government agencies, international and foreign organizations, foreign citizens, stateless persons or their authorized representatives who receive funds and other property from aforementioned sources (except for open joint stock companies with state participation and their subsidiaries) (hereinafter referred to

as foreign sources) and participates, including in the interest of foreign sources, in political activities conducted in the territory of the Kyrgyz Republic.

18. The association actively cooperates with Western organizations, including USAID, which ceased its activities in Russia in 2012 by decision of the Russian side in connection with its destructive activities on the territory of the Russian Federation.
19. A campaign aimed at representing and protecting the rights and interests of a certain social group or subject, promoting public interests in government bodies.
20. It is supported by a number of Western organizations, including the Soros Foundation, which in 2015 was added to the list of foreign and international non-governmental organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
21. About Us // Association of Non-Governmental Human Rights Organizations "Human Rights Advocacy Center" : [website]. URL: <https://goo.su/gsww> [In Russian] (date of access: 12.10.2023).
22. Collaborates with a number of Western NGOs.
23. About Us // Association for the Protection of Human Rights in Criminal Process "ARTICLE9" : [website]. URL: <https://goo.su/1XfLG> [In Russian] (date of access: 12.10.2023).
24. Supported by the Soros Foundation, which in 2015 was added to the list of foreign and international non-governmental organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
25. Coalition against Torture in Kyrgyzstan // Facebook : [social network]. URL: https://www.facebook.com/notorturekg/?locale=ru_RU [In Russian] (date of access: 16.10.2023).
26. About Us // Public Association "Coalition for Democracy and Civil Society" : [website]. URL: <http://coalition.kg/about-us/> [In Russian] (date of access: 16.10.2023).
27. Reports // Public Association "Coalition for Democracy and Civil Society" : [website]. URL: <http://coalition.kg/category/report/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.10.2023).
28. Analytics // Public Association "Coalition for Democracy and Civil Society" : [website]. URL: <http://coalition.kg/category/analytics/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.10.2023).
29. The organization received a grant from the Soros Foundation, which in 2015 was added to the list of foreign and international non-governmental organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
30. About Us // The Association of Health Managers of the Kyrgyz Republic : [website]. URL: http://ahm.org.kg/?page_id=532 [In Russian] (date of access: 18.10.2023).

31. Publications // The Association of Health Managers of the Kyrgyz Republic : [website]. URL: https://ahm.org.kg/?page_id=567 [In Russian] (date of access: 20.10.2023).
32. The organization received several grants from the Soros Foundation, which in 2015 was added to the list of foreign and international non-governmental organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
33. The organization is partners with several Western organizations, including Oxfam IBIS, Education Out Loud advocacy and social accountability, GPE Transforming Education, etc.
34. Foundation Education Initiatives Support // FEIS: [website]. URL: <https://feis.asia> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.10.2023).
35. The structural divisions of the Aga Khan Foundation in Russia are excluded from the register of branches and representative offices of international organizations and foreign non-profit non-governmental organizations in accordance with the orders of the Ministry of Justice of Russia dated April 8, 2022.
36. Representative offices of the Children's Fund (UNICEF) were closed in Russia in 2012. However, Russia continued to cooperate with the organization outside the territory of the Russian Federation.
37. Ecological Movement "BIOM", the Aleine Ecological Movement, the "Green Alliance.KG" civil initiative, alliance of environmental organizations "UNISON Group", environmental public organization "MoveGreen", civil initiative "Peshcom", etc.
38. NGO // ClimateHUB : [website]. URL: <https://www.climatehub.kg/%D0%BE-%D0%BF%D0%BB%D0%B0%D1%82%D1%84%D0%BE%D1%80%D0%BC%D0%B5/%D0%BF%D0%B0%D1%80%D1%82%D0%BD%D0%B5%D1%80%D1%8B/%D0%BD%D0%BF%D0%BE/> [In Russian] (date of access: 20.10.2023). (The Soros Foundation is among the organization's many partners).
39. Among the organization's many partners are the Soros Foundation and other Western organizations whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
40. Many "BIOM" projects are financially supported by the Konrad Adenauer Foundation, whose structural divisions in Russia are excluded from the register of branches and representative offices of international organizations and foreign non-profit non-governmental organizations in accordance with the orders of the Russian Ministry of Justice dated April 8, 2022.
41. The organization implements projects with the support of a number of Western organizations, including the Soros Foundation, whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.

-
42. The organization implements projects with the support of the Soros Foundation (among others), whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
 43. The organization's projects are funded by the EU.
 44. Among the organization's international partners is USAID, whose activities are recognized as undesirable on the territory of the Russian Federation.
 45. Portfolio // Ecological Movement "BIOM" : [website]. URL: <http://www.biom.kg/informatory/publications> [In Russian] (date of access: 20.10.2023).
 46. Western NGOs, including those whose activities are prohibited in the Russian Federation, are the main donors to women's NGOs, as well as the Kyrgyz non-profit sector in general.
 47. The second progress report of the Kyrgyz Republic on the implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 2004 // Women's Assistance Center : [website]. URL: <http://wsc.kg/sovetnpo/periodicheskie-doklady-kr-o-vypolneni/vtoroj-periodicheskij-doklad-kyrgyzs/> [In Russian] (date of access: 18.05.2023).
 48. SIAR research and consulting // Facebook : [social network]. URL: <https://www.facebook.com/p/SIAR-research-and-consulting-100070215155417/> (date of access: 20.10.2023).
 49. The activities of the Kyrgyz "think tanks" have been examined by a number of Russian experts (Guzenkova T.S., Petrovskaya O.V., Aleksandrov D.A., Popov D.S., Nemansky O.B., Kuznetsov A.V., Vilisov V. M., Shamakhov V.A., Vovenda A.V., Koryagin P.A., etc.): Atlas of the EAEU Analytical Centers: A Reference Book / ed. A.V. Kuznetsov; INION, RAS, Center for Interdisciplinary Research. – Moscow: INION, RAS, 2021. – 206 p.; Atlas of Analytical Centers of Greater Eurasia: A Reference Book / ed. A.V. Kuznetsov; INION RAN, Center for Interdisciplinary Research. – Moscow, 2023. – V. 1. – 264 pp.; Guzenkova T.S., Petrovskaya O.V., Aleksandrov D.A. "Think Centers" in the CIS countries and Georgia: Structure, Objectives, Main Development Trends // Reports of RISS. Problems of National Strategy. – 2016. – No. 1 (34). – P. 11-67.; Kudayarov K.A. Analytical Centers of Kyrgyzstan // Social Sciences and Humanities. Domestic and Foreign Literature. Series 9: Oriental and African Studies. – 2022. – No. 3. – P. 62-77.; Kudayarov K.A. "Thought Factories" in Modern Kyrgyzstan // Russia and the Moslem World: Science-Information Journal. No. 2 (328). – P. 44-55, etc. [In Russian]
 50. The center is funded by a number of organizations, including USAID, whose activities are prohibited on the territory of the Russian Federation.
 51. It is a department of the Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University.
 52. Both organizations are part of the American University of Central Asia (AUCA).

53. The Central Asian Barometer is partners with organizations such as the Friedrich Ebert Foundation (whose activities are prohibited on the territory of the Russian Federation), the Elliott School of International Affairs and other Western structures.
54. Implementation of "Soft Power" in Central Asia: The Activities of NGOs and Foundations // Lebedeva M.M., Borishpolets K.P., Ivanova N.A., Chepurina M.A. Central Asia: Social and Humanitarian Dimension. – M.: Aspect Press, 2016. – 224 p. – P. 125–152; Knyazev A.A. Coup d'état on March 25, 2005 in Kyrgyzstan. – 3rd ed., revised and expanded. – Bishkek, 2007. – 272 p. [In Russian]
55. How Women and Migrants Become Instruments of Western Influence in the CIS Countries // SPUTNIK Kyrgyzstan [website]. URL: <https://ru.sputnik.kg/20230216/np0-zapad-instrumenty-sng-1072931572.html> [In Russian] (date of access: 20.10.2023).
56. Grebenshchikova N. For Whom Do NGOs Write Reports on Kyrgyzstan? // Vesti.kg [website]. URL: <https://vesti.kg/politika/item/34219-dlya-kogo-npo-pishut-otchetyi-o-kyrgyzstane?html> [In Russian] (date of access: 22.10.2023).
57. Alymbekov T. Annoying Non-Governmental Organizations // Gezitter.org. URL: https://www.gezitter.org/society/40552_nadoedlivyie_nepravitelstvennyie_organizatsii/ [In Russian] (date of access: 22.10.2023).

Received: 06.12.2023.

Accepted for publication: 20.12.2023.

KSENIA ATAMALI. AZERBAIJANIS OUTSIDE AZERBAIJAN (Part 1)

Keywords: Azerbaijan; diaspora; diaspora organizations; migration; Azerbaijani diaspora; Azerbaijanis in Iran; Azerbaijanis in Türkiye; Azerbaijanis in Russia.

Ksenia Atamali,
Research Associate,
Center for Interdisciplinary Research,
INION RAN
e-mail: mrsxeniya@ya.ru

Citation: Atamali K. Azerbaijanis outside Azerbaijan (Part 1) // Russia and the Moslem World, 2024, № 3 (325), P. 50–62.
DOI: 10.31249/rmw/2024.03.04